Benchmarking

What is it and why do you need to do it?
Presenters

- Dan Carpenter
  Director of Parking and Transit
  University of Nebraska, Lincoln

- Barbara Chance
  President and CEO
  CHANCE Management Advisors, Inc.

- Peter Lange
  Executive Director, Transportation Services
  Texas A & M
What is Benchmarking?

Benchmarking is the process of comparing one's business processes and performance measurements to industry bests or best practices from other industries.

Parking industry measurements typically include business policies and procedures, organization and structure, costs and industry statistics.
When to benchmark?

- Identify scope or areas for improvement (Initiated Internally)
- During institutional or department changes (InitiatedExternally); Master Plan, Projected Institutional Growth
  - The scope may include but is not limited to organizational structure, logistics, policies and procedure, personnel and technological innovations.
  - Prioritize, Prioritize, Prioritize
Spring Semester 2011, The University of Nebraska-Lincoln embarked on several substantial institutional changes directly affecting the campus access and infrastructure, most notably joining the Big 10 and announcing the goal to increase enrollment 5,000 students by 2017.

The administration agreed that we needed to review the department organization and the campus parking infrastructure to focus on supporting these institutional changes. The goal was to insure that the PTS department is operating using best and most current business practices, technology and that we had the infrastructure in place to accommodate growth and to improve our TDM programs.
Benchmarking Strategies

Benchmarking methods may include but are not limited to:

1. Comprehensive Survey of Comparable Performance Indicators (permit fees, space inventory, and citation statistics etc...);
2. Campus Site Visit;

Note: The parking industry is a service sector and the process and measurements varies slightly from the production sector. Typically, focusing on business efficiencies, cost savings, and better operations, whereas production sector is measuring cost per unit.
Benchmarking Strategies (Professional Consulting Services)

During the summer 2011, I began speaking with peers and consultants at IPI and decided to combine the two most common study tools for reviewing the campus parking operation and infrastructure:

1) hiring professional consulting services and
2) the peer review combining the strengths of professional consultant and experience of university peer operators.
UNL issued an RFP for the following tasks:

- Evaluate operations and infrastructure
- Evaluate financial conditions
- Review permit methods and revenue control for state-of-the-art status
- Provide recommendations
- Benchmark financial policies of 10 peers
- Implement a peer review with 4 directors

We responded and were selected
What Dan Wanted

- Assessment of his program
- Benchmarking with peer universities
- Selected Director peer review of particular issues
- Site visits after the peer review to obtain more detail

*CMA did the first three.*
Why Is Benchmarking Useful?

- “Steal” good ideas that you can imitate or improve upon
- Find out what colleagues or competitors are doing
- Make a point to boards or bosses without having to making it yourself
- Find out what you can learn and what you can share
“And this report just in. ... Apparently, the grass is greener on the other side.”
The Importance of Good Data

- Data = Information, but only if you make the effort to make it so
- If you don’t know the details of your program, who does?
- If you don’t know information about now, how can you plan for the future?
- No staff for data gathering and analysis = NO INFORMATION !!
Before Benchmarking

*Research your own policies, procedures and operations first*

So, we reviewed Dan’s operations, staffing, revenue sources, financial obligations, existing and future parking conditions, and technology
### TABLE II-1: Comparisons of Selected Parking and Transit Positions, UNL and Peer Universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Approx. Undergraduate Population [1]</th>
<th>Full-Time Staff</th>
<th>Part-Time Staff</th>
<th>Director of Parking and Transit</th>
<th>Associate Director of Parking</th>
<th>Director/Manager of Transportation</th>
<th>Planning or Manager Planning</th>
<th>Communication or Public Information</th>
<th>Analysts or Grants Specialists</th>
<th>Financial/Business Manager</th>
<th>Alternative Transportation Analyst</th>
<th>Administrative Support</th>
<th>Information System Coordinator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Nebraska, Lincoln</td>
<td>19,383</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Colorado-Boulder</td>
<td>26,325</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>72</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign [3]</td>
<td>32,256</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Iowa</td>
<td>21,564</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>332</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa State University [4]</td>
<td>24,343</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Kansas</td>
<td>19,222</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Minnesota-Twin Cities</td>
<td>34,812</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>235</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Missouri-Columbia [5]</td>
<td>26,024</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ohio State University [6]</td>
<td>42,916</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purdue University</td>
<td>30,776</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*CHANCE Management Advisors, Inc.*
### Table III-1: Parking Permit Rate Growth Since 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rate</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>CAGR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Staff Non Reserved</td>
<td>$492</td>
<td>$522</td>
<td>$552</td>
<td>$552</td>
<td>$552</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Staff Reserved (5 Day)</td>
<td>$972</td>
<td>$1,002</td>
<td>$1,032</td>
<td>$1,032</td>
<td>$1,032</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Staff Reserved (7 Day)</td>
<td>$1,092</td>
<td>$1,122</td>
<td>$1,152</td>
<td>$1,152</td>
<td>$1,152</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Staff Garage</td>
<td>$552</td>
<td>$582</td>
<td>$612</td>
<td>$612</td>
<td>$612</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Non Reserved</td>
<td>$420</td>
<td>$450</td>
<td>$480</td>
<td>$480</td>
<td>$504</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Garage</td>
<td>$540</td>
<td>$570</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>$612</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Reserved</td>
<td>$864</td>
<td>$894</td>
<td>$924</td>
<td>$924</td>
<td>$936</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perimeter</td>
<td>$288</td>
<td>$318</td>
<td>$348</td>
<td>$348</td>
<td>$312</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car Pool</td>
<td>$492</td>
<td>$522</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>$600</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHANCE Management Advisors, Inc.
# PARKING OPERATIONS AND INFRASTRUCTURE REVIEW

## TABLE III-5: Comparisons of Program Scope and Funding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Total Number of Parking Spaces (Included in total)</th>
<th>Number of Garage Spaces</th>
<th>Percent that are Garage Spaces</th>
<th>Accounting or Surface Lots</th>
<th>Accounting or Separate Garages?</th>
<th>Frequency of Rate Reviews</th>
<th>Frequency of Rate Increases</th>
<th>Is a Repair and Replacement Fund Budgeted?</th>
<th>Is a Facilities Assessment Program/Basis for Repair and Replacement Fund?</th>
<th>Parking Management System</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UN-L</td>
<td>16,307</td>
<td>5,046</td>
<td>31% No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Yes [1]</td>
<td>Yes pending</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>T-2 Flex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Illinois at Urbana - Champaign [2]</td>
<td>15,754</td>
<td>4,500</td>
<td>29% pending</td>
<td>pending</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Yes pending</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>T-2 Flex</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa State University</td>
<td>19,382</td>
<td>627</td>
<td>3% No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>No N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Cardinal Tracking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Kansas</td>
<td>15,046</td>
<td>1,574</td>
<td>10% No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Every 3 to 4 years</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Flat amount</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>T-2 Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Minnesota - Twin Cities</td>
<td>20,084</td>
<td>10,264</td>
<td>51% No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>No N/A</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Amano McGann</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Missouri - Columbia</td>
<td>24,000</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td>38% No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No schedule</td>
<td>No schedule</td>
<td>Transfer from excess</td>
<td>1.5% of facility value</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>In-house</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ohio State University</td>
<td>35,024</td>
<td>12,782</td>
<td>36% Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Percent of Operating Budget</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>T-2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[1] Funds obtained from parking surplus account; maintenance estimates conducted in the fall; $300,000 typically.


All parking departments listed operate as auxiliary functions.
**TABLE IV-5: Future Parking Surplus/Deficit**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City Campus</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>2,375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Campus</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,630</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Net Spaces (Displaced)/Added</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City Campus</td>
<td>(744)</td>
<td>(98)</td>
<td>(250)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>(1092)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Campus</td>
<td>(18)</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>762</strong></td>
<td><strong>62</strong></td>
<td><strong>250</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td><strong>1074</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Future Parking Need (Spaces)</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City Campus</td>
<td>1,219</td>
<td>573</td>
<td>725</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>475</td>
<td>3,467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Campus</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,288</strong></td>
<td><strong>588</strong></td>
<td><strong>776</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>526</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,704</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Available Peak Parking Supply (Nov. 2011 A.M.)**

*City Campus Survey Availability*
- Low Occupancy: 4,225 spaces available
- High Occupancy: 3,421 spaces available

*Adjusted Availability (Spaces Available to Accommodate Permits)*
- Low Occupancy: 4,127 spaces available
- High Occupancy: 3,316 spaces available

*East Campus Survey Availability*
- Low Occupancy: 1,507 spaces available
- High Occupancy: 1,326 spaces available

*Adjusted Availability (Spaces Available to Accommodate Permits)*
- Low Occupancy: 1,362 spaces available
- High Occupancy: 1,197 spaces available

CHANCE Management Advisors, Inc.
## Issues for Peer Directors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNL Operations Categories</th>
<th>Your University Approach</th>
<th>Content Assessment of UNL’s Operations</th>
<th>Assessment of “State of the Art” Status</th>
<th>Recommendations, Suggestions, Compliments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visitor and Guest Parking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permits and Registration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enforcement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules and Regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Events</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PEER REVIEW OF PARKING AND TRANSIT POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

http://parking.unl.edu/

Your University Approach

- Parking Garage
- Visitors
- Bikes
- Campuses, Dual Parking
- Other Comments

Account Assessment

- Main daily rate rises 20%. Software meter seeks fewer information. The section is comprehensive. Visitor parking appears to be dispersed among campus. Rented hours of operation and hourly rates. Consider adding payment methods.

Assessment of "State of the Art" Status

- Are the regulations, policies, restrictions, etc. current with respect to effective traffic practices and initiatives? Are they reviewed? Please assess and indicate.

Recommendations, Suggestions, Compliments

- How could URM improve in this area? What facets of URM's approach could be adopted for other universitites?

Other Comments

- We have developed an incentive for our visiitng clients and parking in the area. We use it as incentive for visitors.

Visitor parking appears to be spread around the campus.

We do not differentiate between user groups in visitor parking areas. I feel this is a nice situation. If you can pay the visitor rate you can park.

PERMIT AND REGISTRATION

- Parking permits: faculty, staff, students, visitors
- Annual permit: faculty, staff, students
- Daily permit: faculty, staff, students
- Parking rules in effect
- Indicate if permits are required in all areas
- Indicate if permits are required in specific areas
- Indicate if permits are required in specific areas
- Indicate if permits are required in specific areas
- Indicate if permits are required in specific areas
- Indicate if permits are required in specific areas
“Rules of the Road”

- Limit the questions to a reasonable number – don’t try to benchmark everything
- Respect confidentiality
- Double check – send back to respondents for review
- Be willing to share your own information
- Be prepared to find out some things you may not really have wanted to know
Doing the Benchmarking

- Take the time to decide what you really want to benchmark
- The process takes more time than you might imagine
- You are lucky if you know the folks that you want to respond
- Consistency is VERY important
  - Same person
  - Same questions
  - Same follow-up
Doing the Benchmarking

- Results are too much to convey just in narrative – pick a way to illustrate
- Don’t go down the “rabbit hole” or “into the weeds”
Benchmarking Strategies (Site Visit)

- As the study concluded, and while reviewing the CHANCE Management recommendations and comments from peer directors, and given the lack of opportunity for an UNL site visit, I decided to develop a strategy and make the site visit to two of the four institutions used in the peer review section of the study.

- The benchmarking strategy focused on operational, personnel, logistics and policy concepts, and few primary recommendations like procuring a comprehensive permit, citation event and PARCS management system.

- The benchmarking tool, for Nebraska is the opportunity to view the applied operational practices, and access increasingly detailed information and policies of peer institutions.
The Site Visit

- Why this type of sharing is important for the industry?
- Logistical Elements
- Time Commitment
Why this type of sharing is important for the industry?

- Plus up or down original ideas from others
- University culture focuses on sharing ideas
- Understand philosophies behind decisions
- Anticipate and avoid problems experienced by others
- Expand network of peers to call with new ideas or questions
Logistical Elements

Pre-planning

– Agenda
  • Discuss with leader of visiting group
  • Internal time for setting agenda and working with staff schedules

– Personnel
  • Hosts, subject matter experts

– Facilities
  • Highlight areas of interest for visiting group
  • Driving tour scripting
  • Walking tour
Logistical Elements

Remember the small details

◆ Links to recommended hotels and restaurants
◆ Reserve space to meet
  ➔ Include necessary equipment, such as laptop/projector
  ➔ Make snacks and beverages available
◆ Will they need rides from the airport or hotel?
◆ If driving, provide clear directions
◆ Working lunch makes good use of time and saves money
Time Commitment

Pre-arrival logistical arrangements

◆ Pre-arrival agenda setting and data gathering
◆ Block of time for site visit
  ➔ Determined by scope of operation being observed
  ➔ Determined by travel time to get to site
    – 1.5-2 days if coming from long distance
    – ½ or full day if coming from reasonable driving distance
◆ Advance set up of mock event or equipment install

Dedicated staff time to host/present during visit
Final Tips

- Pre-planning of the agenda and logistical items is key.
- Be prepared and have data about the organization and the specific portions of the operation of the most interest to your guests.
- Set an agenda, but where possible be flexible if a portion of the conversation runs long.
- If more detail is wanted, set up time for a separate conference call or break out session.
Questions & Thank You